

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
7	1364 to 1369	12/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Judson discussing article "NJ: Republican Thinkers Launch New Climate-Change Initiative," with five page attached article released. One sentence in first page of email redacted because it contains deliberative and predecisional analysis regarding relevance of article to potential staff- level policy recommendations. Mobile phone numbers are also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	6 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 5 pages released in full.
9	1372 to 1373	26/Jan/12	Two-page Internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to C. Soares (with copies to S. Shore and R. Mariger) re: "Paulson-Swagel Work on carbon tax." Three sentences are redacted because they contain deliberative and pre-decisional staff analysis re use of the Paulson work for potential future staff-level policy initiative. Mobile phone numbers are also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages released in part.
10	1374 to 1463	26/Jan/12	Two-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and D. Hall (with copy to E. Urbanas) re: "Paulson-Swagel Work on carbon tax." Two sentences in email are redacted because they contain deliberative and pre-decisional staff analysis regarding use of the Paulson work for potential future staff-level policy initiative. Four PowerPoint attachments (entitled "Climate Presentation", "Pro-Growth Climate Policy," "Cap and Trade Climate Presentation," and "Climate Notebook"), 88 pages in total are redacted as deliberative and pre-decisional, because they contain draft, pre-decisional analysis and discussion conducted in 2007-2008 by Treasury staff under Secretary Paulson. Mobile phone numbers are also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	90 pages in total. 1 page released in part, 1 page released in full, and 88 pages withheld in full.
16	1473 to 1474	28/Feb/12	Two-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalfe to M. Mazur re: "Invitation to March 14 carbon tax experts meeting." One sentence was redacted because it contains deliberative and pre-decisional analysis re: potential Treasury staff actions at meeting. Also redacted are mobile phone numbers and personal email addresses.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages released in part.
19	1479 to 1481	27/Apr/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to D. Hall and J. Jaffe-, discussing and attaching two-page undated draft memorandum containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. All are withheld in full. Mobile phone number is also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
20	1482 to 1483	27/Apr/12	Two-page Internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe to D. Hall, discussing changes and additions to a draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental developmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
21	1484 to 1486	27/Apr/12	Three-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and D. Hall discussing changes and additions to a draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental developmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
22	1487 to 1490	27/Apr/12	One page internal Treasury email from D. Hall to J. Jaffe, discussing and attaching three-page draft memorandum dated 20120427 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level, included multiple staff edits, but was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
23	1491 to 1494	27/Apr/12	One page internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe to; D. Hall attaching a three-page draft memorandum dated 20120427 containing economic and environmental developmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level, included multiple staff edits and redlined textual recommendations, but was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
24	1495 to 1500	27/Apr/12	Four-page internal Treasury email from D. Hall to G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe and copy to E. Urbanas discussing and attaching an two-page draft memorandum dated 20120427 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and included staff comments but was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	6 pages in total. 6 pages withheld in full.
25	1501 to 1503	28/Apr/12	One page internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe to D. Hall discussing and attaching a two-page draft memorandum dated 20120427 containing economic and environmental development policy analysis. Draft consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
29	1510 to 1512	1/May/12	Three-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and D. Hall re: RFF meeting on Carbon Tax Analysis. Portions of the email are redacted because they contain personal family information about Treasury staffer. Also redacted mobile phone numbers and personal email addresses. (Revised on 2/7/2014)	(b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 2 pages released in part. 1 page released in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
30	1513 to 1515	3/May/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to D. Hall and J. Jaffe, discussing and attaching two-page draft memorandum dated 20120427 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and included staff edits and comments but was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
31	1516 to 1523	3/May/12	One page internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe to G. Metcalf and copy to D. Hall re "Revenue Offsets from Carbon Charge," attaching a seven-page 2009 CBO memorandum (released in full). Withheld email page is Treasury staff analysis of and proposal for use of data for purposes of potential future action on draft staff-level policy proposal.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	8 pages total. 1 page withheld in full. 7 pages released in full.
32	1524 to 1525	3/May/12	Two-page Internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to D. Hall and J. Jaffe discussing a memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental developmental policy analysis Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	2 pages total. 2 pages withheld in full.
33	1526 to 1527	4/May/12	Two-page internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe to G. Metcalf re: "Revenue offsets from Carbon Charge" related to economic modeling for a draft staff-level policy proposal that was never finalized. In the email, staff opine on different estimates and assumptions in studies prepared by the Energy Information Administration in 2011 and CBO in 2009. These opinions are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number is also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 1 page released in full.
34	1528 to 1530	4/May/12	Three-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and D. Hall, re: "Revenue offsets from Carbon Charge" related to economic modeling for a draft staff-level policy proposal that was never finalized. In the email, staff opine on different estimates and assumptions in studies prepared by the Energy Information Administration in 2011 and CBO in 2009. These opinions are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number is also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 2 pages withheld in full.
38	1537 to 1539	8/May/12	One page internal Treasury email from D. Hall to J. Jaffe, discussing and attaching draft two-page document containing staff analysis based on data in a 2011 CBO report and possible options related to draft staff-level policy proposal. Both email and attached document contain deliberative and pre-decisional analysis.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
39	1540 to 1543	8/May/12	One page internal Treasury email from D. Hall to J. Jaffe, discussing and attaching draft three-page document containing staff analysis based on data in a 2011 CBO report and possible options related to draft staff-level policy proposal. Both email and attached document contain deliberative and pre-decisional analysis.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
40	1544 to 1547	8/May/12	One page internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe to D. Hall, discussing and attaching draft three-page document containing staff analysis based on data in a 2011 CBO report and possible options related to draft staff-level policy proposal. Document includes multiple redline edits. Both email and attached document contain deliberative and pre-decisional analysis.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
41	1548 to 1550	8/May/12	One page internal Treasury email from D. Hall to G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe, discussing and attaching draft two-page document containing staff analysis based on data in a 2011 CBO report and possible options related to draft staff-level policy proposal. Both email and attached document contain deliberative and pre-decisional analysis.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
43	1553 to 1554	9/May/12	Two-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to D. Hall and J. Jaffe responding to staff analysis and suggesting further ways to refine the draft staff-level policy proposal. Email was prepared at staff level and contains deliberative and pre-decisional analysis regarding options for draft presentation.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	2 pages in total. 2 pages withheld in full.
44	1555	5/Jun/12	One page internal Treasury email from M. Mazur to G. Metcalf discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	1 page in total. 1 page withheld in full.
45	1556 to 1559	8/Jun/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and D. Hall, discussing and attaching a three-page draft memorandum dated 20120608 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and predecisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
47	1564 to 1565	12/Jun/12	Two-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and D. Hall discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and predecisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	2 pages total. 2 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
48	1566 to 1569	12/Jun/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to B. Tonkonogy, (with copies to E. Urbanas, A. Demopoulos, D. Hall, J. Jaffe, E. Lien, K. Berg, and M. Bonaiuto) discussing and attaching a three-page draft memorandum dated 20120611 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and predecisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
49	1570 to 1573	13/Jun/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and D. Hall, discussing and attaching a three-page draft memorandum dated 20120611 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and predecisional. With three-page draft memo attached.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
51	1578 to 1579	14/Jun/12	Two-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to M. Bonaiuto discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	2 pages total. 2 pages withheld in full.
52	1580 to 1583	20/Jun/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to A. Gelber and S. Aaronson, with copy to J. Jaffe, discussing and attaching three-page draft memorandum dated 20120611 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
53	1584	20/Jun/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe discussing potential arguments related to draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	1 page in total. 1 page withheld in full.
54	1585	22/Jun/12	One page internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe to G. Metcalf discussing potential arguments related to draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	1 page in total. 1 page withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
55	1586 to 1587	22/Jun/12	Two-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	2 pages total. 2 pages withheld in full.
56	1588 to 1589	25/Jun/12	Two-page internal Treasury email from M. Heil to J. Jaffe re: "Pending energy/envir work." Email contains deliberative and pre-decisional discussion of potential future policy proposal.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	2 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 1 page released in full.
57	1590 to 1593	3/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to L. Brainard (and copies to S. Fazili and M. Lago) discussing and attaching a three-page draft memorandum dated 20120611 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and draft memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
59	1596 to 1611	5/Jul/12	One page email from White House employee N. Keohane to Treasury employee G. Metcalf forwarding "Resources for the Future" article. Withheld portion of cover email contains deliberative information shared between staff. Also, office phone number, mobile phone number, and office room number are redacted. Revised on 2/6/ 2014.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	16 pages in total. 1 withheld in full. 15 released in full.
61	1614	10/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe to G. Metcalf regarding a magazine (Economist) leader story: Redacted portion contains a deliberative statement about potential future use of the magazine article. Mobile phone number also is redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page total. 1 page released in part.
62	1615	10/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to M. Lago regarding a leader in most recent Economist: Redacted sentence discusses potential future staff meeting and follow-up on draft staff-level policy proposal. Mobile phone number is also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page total. 1 page released in part.
63	1616 to 1618	10/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to Climate Team forwarding an article: Republican Thinkers Launch New Climate-Change Initiative: Redacted mobile phone number.	(b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 2 pages released in part. 1 page released in full.
65	1625 to 1629	10/Jul/12	Two-page internal Treasury staff email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe containing Treasury staff discussion of data from international tax comparisons for use in possible future staff-level policy initiative. Attached to the email is a three-page draft memorandum dated 201220710 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	5 pages in total. 2 pages released in part. 3 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
66	1630 to 1634	12/Jul/12	Two-page internal Treasury email chain between from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe discussing and attaching three-page draft memorandum dated 20120710 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	5 pages in total. 5 pages withheld in full.
67	1635 to 1637	12/Jul/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange chain between J. Jaffe and G. Metcalf discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
69	1643 to 1646	12/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and E. Urbanas discussing and attaching three-page draft memorandum dated 20120712 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
70	1647 to 1650	12/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Eberly, M. Mazur (and copies to A. Gelber, S. Aaronson, and J. Jaffe) discussing and attaching three-page draft memorandum dated 20120712 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
71	1651 to 1653	12/Jul/12	Three-page internal Treasury email from J. Jaffe and G. Metcalf discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
72	1654 to 1659	12/Jul/12	One page Internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe containing NJ article: <i>Republican Thinkers Launch New Climate-Change Initiative</i> : Redacted mobile phone numbers and redacted comments on magazine article discussing how it may impact possible future policy initiative.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	6 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 5 pages released in full.
74	1665 to 1667	13/Jul/12	Three-page Internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf, to J. Eberly, L. Brainard, M. Mazur, and M. Lago (and copies to S. Fazili and L. Black) regarding press article FW: another convert. Redacted mobile phone number.	(b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 1-2-pages released in part. 2 1 pages-released in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
75	1668	13/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from M. Mazur to G. Metcalf discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. A mobile phone number was also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page withheld in full.
76	1669 to 1670	16/Jul/12	Two-page interagency email from Treasury employee G. Metcalf to White House employee J. Bordoff with staff opinion redacted regarding the possible effect of news article on possible draft staff-level policy proposal. Mobile phone number also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages released in part.
78	1673 to 1675	16/Jul/12	Three-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to R.DeValk incorporating entire article from The Hill- "GOP leadership slam the door on carbon taxes." Redacted sentence in the email contains opinion from Treasury official regarding possible outcome of a carbon tax proposal. Mobile phone number is redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 2 pages released in full.
80	1680 to 1683	17/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe and copy to E. Urbanas discussing and attaching three-page draft memorandum dated 20120712 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.
83	1697	20/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe discussing draft memorandum containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	1 page in total. 1 page withheld in full.
84	1698 to 1707	23/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Eberly and M. Mazur (with copies to A. Gelber, S. Aaronson, J. Jaffe, E. Urbanas, H. Das, and R. McKeehan) discussing a nine-page attachment dated 20120723. The attachment concerned economic and environmental policy analysis and contained a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level but was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange and attachment are deliberative and predecisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	10 pages in total. 10 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
85	1708 to 1718	23/Jul/12	Two-page internal Treasury email-exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, J. Eberly, M. Mazur, A. Gelber, L. Abraham, S. Aaronson, H. Das, and R. McKeehan discussing a nine-page attachment dated 20120723. The attachment concerned economic and environmental policy analysis and contained a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and included staff comments but was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	11 pages in total. 11 pages withheld in full.
86	1719 to 1720	23/Jul/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, B. Urbanas, H. Das, R. McKeehan, J. Eberly, M. Mazur, A. Gelber, S. Aaronson discussing a draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages withheld in full.
88	1733 to 1734	25/Jul/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange between officials G. Metcalf, M. Mazur and J. Eberly and included E. McMahon J. Jaffe, B. Urbanas, H. Das, R. McKeehan A. Gelber, S. Aaronson, discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email is deliberative and pre-decisional regarding draft memorandum. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages withheld in full.
90	1738 to 1749	26/Jul/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between R. McKeehan to G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe, and included B. Urbanas, H. Das, R. McKeehan, J. Eberly, M. Mazur, A. Gelber, S. Aaronson, E. McMahon, discussing a nine-page attachment dated 20120723 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level, included staff redlined edits and comments, but was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange and attached memorandum and associated documents are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	12 pages in total. 12 pages withheld in full.
91	1750 to 1753	27/Jul/12	Four-page internal Treasury email exchanges between from R. McKeehan to G. Metcalf, and J. Jaffe, (H.Das) discussing a draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
94	1776 to 1777	31/Jul/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange between Jaffe to R. McKeehan and Metcalf, J. Jaffe, B. Urbanas, H. Das, R. McKeehan, J. Eberly, M. Mazur, A. Gelber, S. Aaronson discussing a draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages withheld in full.
95	1778 to 1841	31/Jul/12	Four-page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe discussing and attaching a ten-page draft memorandum dated 20120731 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Also attached is one page of comments and suggested edits and changes to the memorandum. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and contained multiple staff edits and comments but was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum with suggested edits and changes are deliberative and pre-decisional. Brookings report (49 pages) on carbon tax is also attached and released in full.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	64 pages in total. 15 pages withheld in full. 49 pages released in full.
96	1842 to 1844	31/Jul/12	Three-page internal Treasury email between Treasury officials G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe discussing a draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
97	1845 to 1857	31/Jul/12	Three-pages of internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe, discussing and attaching a ten-page draft memorandum dated 20120731 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level, contained multiple red-lined staff edits, but was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	13 pages in total. 13 pages withheld in full.
99	1867 to 1868	31/Jul/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange between J. Jaffe and G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe discussing a draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange is deliberative. and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
100	1869 to 1878	31/Jul/12	Two-pages of internal Treasury email exchanges between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, B. Urbanas, H. Das, R. McKeehan, J. Eberly, M. Mazur, A. Gelber, S. Aaronson, discussing and attaching an eight-page draft memorandum dated 20120731 containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	10 pages in total. 10 pages withheld in full.
101	1879 to 1881	31/Jul/12	Three-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to L. Brainard and J. Jaffe regarding CNN article embedded in the email. The redacted text in the email contains deliberative and pre-decisional analysis re use of press article in draft staff-level policy proposal. Redacted mobile phone number.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 1 page redacted in part. 2 pages released in full.
102	1882 to 1885	31/Jul/12	Four-page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, L. Brainard, J. Jaffe regarding a CNN article embedded in the email. The redacted text in the email is deliberative and pre-decisional concerning use of press article and contains communication in draft staff-level policy proposal. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages in total. 1 page withheld in full. 1 page released in part. 2 pages released in full.
103	1886 to 1889	31/Jul/12	Four-page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe regarding CNN article embedded in the email. The email contain deliberative and pre-decisional analysis re use of press article in draft staff-level policy proposal. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages in total. 2 pages withheld in full. 1 page released in part. 1 page released in full.
104	1890 to 1892	1/Aug/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe and A. Gelber discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. regarding draft memorandum.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
105	1893 to 1895	1/Aug/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchanges between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe and A. Gelber discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
106	1896 to 1907	1/Aug/12	Three- page internal Treasury email exchanges between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, H. Das, M. Mazur, E. Lien, B. Urbanas, R. McKeehan, J. Eberly, S. Aaronson, A. Gelber, discussing a nine-page attachment dated 20120801 consisting of four-page draft memorandum, three-page National Journal article, and one page clearance sheet. The attachment concerned economic and environmental policy analysis and contained a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level but was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange and attached memorandum and associated documents are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	12 pages in total. 12 pages withheld in full.
107	1908 to 1910	1/Aug/12	Three-page Internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, H. Das, M. Mazur, E. Lien, B. Urbanas, R. McKeehan, J. Eberly, S. Aaronson, A. Gelber discussing draft memorandum containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
108	1911 to 1922	1/Aug/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, H. Das, M. Mazur, E. Lien, B. Urbanas, R. McKeehan, J. Eberly, S. Aaronson, A. Gelber, discussing a nine-page attachment dated 20120801 containing economic and environmental policy analysis and contained a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and included staff redlined edits and comments but was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange and attached memorandum and associated documents are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	12 pages in total. 12 pages withheld in full.
112	1955 to 1958	2/Aug/12	Four-page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, A. Gelber and J. Eberly discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages total. 4 pages withheld in full.
113	1959 to 1962	3/Aug/12	Four-page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, A. Gelber, and J. Eberly discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages total. 4 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
114	1963	3/Aug/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, and A. Gelber discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page total. 1 page withheld in full.
115	1964 to 1965	3/Aug/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, A. Gelber discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages total. 2 pages withheld in full.
116	1966 to 1967	3/Aug/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, A. Gelber discussing draft memorandum containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages total. 2 pages withheld in full.
119	2001 to 2003	3/Aug/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, A. Gelber discussing draft memorandum containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages total. 3 pages withheld in full.
120	2004 to 2013	3/Aug/12	One page of internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe, discussing a nine-page attachment dated 20120803 concerning economic and environmental policy analysis and contained a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and included staff comments but was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange and attached memorandum and associated documents are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	10 pages total. 10 pages withheld in full.
121	2014-2023	3/Aug/12	One page of internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, S. Fazili and B. Urbanas, discussing a nine-page attachment dated 20120803 concerning economic and environmental policy analysis and contained a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and included staff comments but was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange and attached memorandum and associated documents are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	10 pages total. 10 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
122	2024	3/Aug/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, S. Fazili and B. Urbanas discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page total. 1 page withheld in full.
123	2025	3/Aug/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf and J. Jaffe discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page total. 1 page withheld in full.
124	2026	3/Aug/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, S. Fazili and B. Urbanas discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page total. 1 page withheld in full.
127	2047 to 2048	6/Aug/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange between J. Jaffe and S. Fazili discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	2 pages total. 2 pages withheld in full.
129	2061-2063	7/Aug/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe and S. Fazili discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	3 pages total. 3 pages withheld in full.
130	2064-2066	7/Aug/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe and S. Fazili discussing draft memorandum (not attached) containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, email exchange is deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	3 pages total. 3 pages withheld in full.
133	2107-2116	8/Aug/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe and S. Fazili, discussing a nine-page attachment dated 20120808 concerning economic and environmental policy analysis and contained a policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and included staff comments but was never finalized. Accordingly, the email exchange and attached memorandum and associated documents are deliberative and pre-decisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	10 pages total. 10 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
158	2380 to 2387	31/Jan/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange between Baker, A. Ambriz, D. Douglass, C. Smart, R. Jarpe, L. Moghtader, S. Le Bouder, and S. Fazili, with six page draft talking points document attached. Email and draft talking points concern possible Treasury staff meeting and briefing for Congress on general European economic developments. Talking points are organized on a country by country basis. Only one sentence in draft talking points document -- which sentence discussed carbon taxes in Ireland -- was responsive, and it was released in full. Treasury initially treated other portions of the email and talking points document as nonresponsive. In January, even though the NR portions continue to be considered nonresponsive, Treasury redacted these portions under Exemption 5 as pre-deliberative staff discussions on content of draft talking points and staff opinions on European country issues. Personal cellular number also withheld under Exemption 6. This was one of the ten NR documents of special interest to CEI in January 2014	(b)(6) Personal Privacy Information; NR -- but also (b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege if Responsive	8 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in part. 5 pages withheld in full.
159	2388 to 2396	10/Feb/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between J. Baker, A. Ambriz, D. Douglass, C. Smart, R. Jarpe, L. Moghtader, S. Le Bouder, and S. Fazili, with six page draft talking points document attached. Email and draft talking points concern possible Treasury staff meeting and briefing for Congress on general European economic developments. Talking points are organized on a country by country basis and have the same date as the talking points in the index entry immediately above. Treasury initially treated other portions of the email and talking points document as nonresponsive. In January, even though the NR portions continue to be considered nonresponsive, Treasury redacted these portions under Exemption 5 as pre-deliberative staff discussions on content of draft talking points and staff opinions on European country issues. The title of the attachment (on the first page of the email chain) is "EZ Country Reform Highlights." Personal cellular number also withheld. This was one of the ten NR documents of special interest to CEI in January 2014.	NR but later (b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information;	9 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in part. 1 page released in full. 5 pages withheld in full.
161	2493 to 2495	4/Sep/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange entitled "EE Priorities for 2012 (final)" between E. Urbanas, G. McDonald, and A. Demopolos, with two page draft document about office priorities attached. Email and attached priorities paper (withheld in full) reflect intra-agency deliberation by Treasury staff about tentative goals and possible future actions by office staff.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	3 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 2 pages withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
162	2496 to 2498	1/Feb/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange entitled "EE Priorities for 2012 (final)" between. Urbanas, G. Metcalf, and A. Demopulos, with two page draft document about office priorities attached. Email and attached priorities paper (withheld in full) reflect intra-agency staff deliberation about tentative goals and possible future actions by office staff.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	3 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 2 pages withheld in full.
163	2499 to 2503	16/Mar/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between B. Tonkonogy, H. Das, A. Demopulos, E. Urbanas, and G. Metcalf, with four page draft information memo, on private sector strategy. Text in the email and the entire attached draft memo reflects predecisional intra-agency staff deliberation about possible future action to implement international private sector engagement strategy. Proposed goals and outcomes are included in the draft info memo. Personal cellular number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	5 pages in total. 1 pages released in part. 4 pages withheld in full.
164	2504 to 2509	16/Mar/12	Two-page internal Treasury email exchange entitled "FW: private sector strategy info memo" between B. Tonkonogy, H. Das, A. Demopulos, E. Urbanas, and G. Metcalf, with four page draft information memo about private sector strategy. Proposed goals and outcomes are included in the draft info memo. Draft info memo includes redlined legal staff comments. Withheld text, in the email and the entire attached draft memo reflects predecisional intra-agency staff deliberation about possible future action to implement international private sector engagement strategy Personal cellular number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	6 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 1 page released in full. 4 pages withheld in full.
168	2525 to 2531	1/Feb/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between D. Hall and J. Jaffe, with six page draft coal plant memorandum (long version) attached. Draft memo is withheld in full. Withheld text in email and draft memo reflects intra-agency opinions, staff options and deliberation about possible future actions.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	7 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 6 pages withheld in full.
169	2532 to 2535	30/Jan/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury's D. Hall and J. Jaffe, with three page draft coal plant retirement memo (short version) attached. Draft memo is withheld in full. Email and text of draft memo reflect intra-agency opinions, staff options, and deliberation about possible future actions.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	4 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 3 pages withheld in full.
171	2581 to 2588	1/Feb/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between D. Hall and J. Jaffe, with seven page draft coal plant memorandum (long version) attached. Draft memo is withheld in full. Withheld text in email and draft memo reflects intra-agency opinions, staff options and deliberation about possible future actions.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege;	8 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 7 pages withheld in full.
173	2603 to 2606	13/Sep/12	Four-page email exchange between Treasury officials J. Jaffe and G. Metcalf re "MIT Paper," with forwarded message between CBO official T. Dinan and MIT professor J. O'Reilly. Redacted text in Treasury discussion reflects intra-agency deliberation about possible future action and contains staff speculation and opinions. Personal phone numbers and personal email address of MIT professor are redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal information; Non-Responsive	4 pages in total. 3 pages released in full. 1 page released in part.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
179	2636 to 2645	2/Jul/12	One page email from-Treasury official E. Lien to State Dep't official P. Bodnar entitled "U.S. Presentation LTF workshop1" with nine page draft talking point document attached. Attachment contains talking points for possible U.S. intervention in upcoming international meeting on carbon related issues that are pre-decisional and deliberative. There are multiple redlined comments on the attachment.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	10 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 9 pages withheld in full.
180	2646 to 2655	3/Jul/12	One page email from Treasury official E. Lien to State Dep't official P. Bodnar entitled "U.S. Presentation LTF workshop1" with nine page draft talking point document attached. Attachment contains talking points for possible U.S. intervention in upcoming international meeting on carbon related issues that are pre-decisional and deliberative. There are multiple redlined comments on the attachment .	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	10 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 9 pages withheld in full.
181	2656 to 2657	11/Jul/12	Mobile phone number redacted (Revised 2/7/2014)	(b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 1pages released in full and 1 page released in part.
182	2658-2659	9/Feb/12	RELEASED IN FULL ON 2/7/2014		2 pages in total. 2 page released in full.
183	2660 to 2661	11/Sep/12	RELEASED IN FULL ON 2/7/2014		2 pages in total. 2 page released in full.
186	2668 to 2671	31/Jul/12	Four-page internal Treasury email chain between G. Metcalf, J. Jaffe, and L. Brainard re : comments on CNN interview on "Do Nothing Congress." Redacted text contains deliberative and pre-decisional analysis re draft staff-level policy proposal. Personal cellular number also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages in total. 3 pages released in part. 1 page released in full.
187	2672 to 2674	11/Sep/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, N. Earnest, A. Fitzpayne, J. LeCompte, K. Alaimo, M. Hopkins, H. Das, E. Urbanas, and J. Jaffe containing comments on Daily Caller article regarding CEI FOIA litigation. Redacted text reflects intra-agency deliberations about possible future response to the lawsuit. Personal cellular number also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 2 pages released in full.
188	2675 to 2678	11/Jul/12	Four-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to J. Jaffe re: news article in the E&E Daily, with copy of article on carbon tax included in the email. Redacted sentence contains staff opinion about draft staff-level policy proposal.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 3 pages released in full.
189	2684	17/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email chain between R. McKeehan, G. Metcalf, and internal email distribution group "Climate Team" regarding comments on speeches by Sen. Rockefeller and former Secretary Shultz. Redacted text reflects staff opinion about views of former Secretary Shultz. Personal cellular number also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page in total. 1 page released in part.
201	2762 to 2764	8/Jun/12	Three-page internal Treasury email exchange between G. Metcalf, D. Hall, and J. Jaffe, which includes a forwarded email exchange with a non USG individual, regarding Korea's carbon trading legislation. Redacted text in Treasury emails reflects intra-agency deliberations about possible future action re staff level policy proposal. Personal cellular numbers and personal email addresses are also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages released in part.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
213	2850 to 2852	25/Mar/12	RELEASED IN FULL ON 2/7/2014		
218	2874 to 2877	31/Aug/12	One page internal Treasury email entitled "Talking Points for RFF Role of Border Measures Panel" from J. Jaffe to G. Metcalf and B. Tonkonogy attaching a three-page draft staff presentation concerning market-based environmental policy issues. The withheld text presentation reflects intra-agency considerations about possible future action that are deliberative and predecisional.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	4 pages in total. 4 withheld in full.
231	3401 to 3409	12/Sep/12	Nine-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to Tonkonogy, Demopulos, Jaffe & Urbanas, forwarding article sent by T. Stern (State) entitled "Cleaning up Coal." First page of the email contains redacted text that reflects staff opinions and inter-agency deliberation over one financial argument raised in the article. Following eight pages of the email contain the article and are released in their entirety. Personal cellular number also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	9 pages total (1 released in part, 8 released in full)
241	3462 - 3465	20/Jan/12	Three-page Interagency email exchange from R. Leatham (State) to A. Demopulos (Treasury) discussing U.S. Government input into World Bank Environment Strategy document. The text redacted under (b)(5) at the bottom of the email chain -- opinions of a U.S. staffer at the Office of the U.S. Executive Director at the World Bank -- should have been redacted instead as non-responsive. This NR text discusses various World Bank strategies and does not contain any of the FOIA search terms. Already released text at the bottom indicates no explicit reference to carbon taxes. In January, even though the NR portions continue to be considered nonresponsive, Treasury redacted these portions under Exemption 5 as pre-deliberative staff discussions on World Bank strategies. Personal cellular and email addresses are also redacted. This was one of the ten NR documents of special interest to CEI in January 2014. Personal cellular and email addresses are also redacted.	(b)(6) Personal Privacy Information; NR	4 pages in total. 4 pages released in part.
247	3492 - 3500	12/Sep/12	Nine-page email exchange/discussion among Treasury and State officials G. Metcalf, T. Stern, P. Bodnar, and J. Brown about Foreign Affairs article "Cleaning Up Coal". First page of the email contains redacted text that reflects staff opinions and inter-agency deliberation over one financial argument raised in the article. Following eight pages of the email contain the article and are released in their entirety. Personal cellular number also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	9 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 8 pages released in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
248	3501 - 3509	25/Jan/12	Five-page interagency email exchange (top email between Treasury officials D. Hall and G. Metcalf) discussing USG communications strategy for U.S. position on EU Emissions Trading Strategy for the international aviation sector, with four-page draft strategy paper attached. Text of email and draft strategy paper reflects inter-agency discussion by government staff about possible future USG action. Strategy paper contains multiple redlined edits. Personal mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	9 pages in total. 9 pages withheld in full.
249	3510 - 3512	16/May/12	Identical to Document 29. Three-page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to other staff J. Jaffe and D. Hall re: RFF meeting on Carbon Tax Analysis. Portions of the email are redacted because they contain personal, family information about Treasury staffer. Also redacted mobile phone numbers and personal email addresses. (Revised on 2/7/2014)	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 2 pages withheld in part. 1 page released in full.
254	3535 - 3543	25/Jan/12	Five-page interagency email exchange (top email between Treasury officials D. Hall and G. Metcalf) discussing USG communications strategy for U.S. position on EU Emissions Trading Strategy for the international aviation sector, with four page draft strategy paper attached. Text of email and draft strategy paper reflects inter-agency discussion by government staff about possible future USG action. Personal mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	9 pages in total. 9 pages withheld in full.
255	3544 - 3552	25/Jan/12	Five-page interagency email exchange (top email between Treasury officials D. Hall and G. Metcalf) discussing USG communications strategy for U.S. position on EU Emissions Trading Strategy for the international aviation sector, with four page draft strategy paper attached. Text of email and draft strategy paper reflects inter-agency discussion by government staff about possible future USG action. Strategy paper contains multiple redlined edits. Personal mobile phone number also withheld.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	9 pages in total. 9 pages withheld in full.
256	3553 - 3558	12/Jul/12	One page internal Treasury email exchange between Treasury officials G. Metcalf and D. Hall regarding article on Republican thinkers' climate change initiative, with five page article attached. Redacted text on first page contains staff recommendation about possible future action related to draft staff-level policy proposal.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege; (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	6 pages in total. 1 page withheld in part. 5 pages released in full.
261	3615 to 3616	16/Jul/12	Two-page interagency email exchange sent between Treasury employee G. Metcalf and White House employee J. Bordoff, related to article on carbon tax and tax reform. Redacted text reflects staff opinion about article. Mobile phone number is also redacted.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages released in part.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
263	3623 to 3624	7/May/12	Two-page interagency email between Treasury employee G. Metcalf to White House employee and N. Keohane about revenue offsets in carbon tax estimates. Redacted text reflects staff opinion about carbon tax revenues in CBO analysis. Mobile phone number is also redacted.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. 2 pages released in part.
264	3631 to 3633	28/Apr/12	One page Interagency email from Treasury's G. Metcalf to White House employee N. Keohane (and copies to Treasury employees D. Hall and J. Jaffe) discussing and attaching two-page draft memorandum containing economic and environment policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number is also redacted	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full
265	3634-3637	12/Jun/12	One page interagency email from Treasury employee G. Metcalf to White House employee J. Bordoff, discussing and attaching three-page draft memorandum containing economic and environmental policy analysis. Draft memorandum consisted of policy proposal that was prepared at staff level and was never finalized. Accordingly, both email exchange and attached memorandum are deliberative and pre-decisional. Mobile phone number is also redacted.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages in total. 4 pages withheld in full
268	3690-3697	12/Aug/12	One page interagency email from Treasury employee G. Metcalf to State's employee J. Pershing with seven page US Embassy cable providing details of Australia's carbon pricing scheme attached. Cable is released in full. Redacted text in email reflects inter-agency discussion by government staff of possible future action.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	8 pages in total, 1 page released in part. 7 pages released in full.
269	3698-3700	26/Jul/12	Three-page interagency email between Treasury employee G. Metcalf and White House employee N. Keohane related to USG participation in Brookings carbon tax workshop. Redacted text reflects inter-agency discussion by government staff of possible future action. Mobile phone number and personal email addresses are also redacted.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 2 pages released in part. 1 page released in full.
270	3701-3703	14/Sep/12	Three-page interagency email among Treasury employees G. Metcalf and White House employees J. Bordoff and R. Duke relating to E. Klein article about tax policy. Article is reproduced in the email. Redacted text reflects opinion of government staffer about the article. Mobile phone number and email address are also redacted.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 2 pages released in part. 1 page released in full.
272	3707	25/Jan/12	One page interagency email between Treasury employees G. Metcalf and White House employee J. Bordoff containing staff discussion on possible future initiative; redaction of email addresses and mobile phone number.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page in total. 1 page withheld in full.

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE v. U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY**Vaughn Index, Provided to Plaintiff CEI**

DOCUMENT	BATES RANGE	DATE OF DOCUMENT	DESCRIPTION OF MATERIAL REDACTED AND JUSTIFICATION FOR REDACTION	EXEMPTION	REDACTION ANALYSIS
278	3721	19/Mar/12	One page interagency email between Treasury employee G. Metcalf and White House employee N. Keohane that discusses options as to how to respond to inquiry from Congressional staffer. Discussion is deliberative and pre-decisional. Phone numbers and email address are also withheld.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	1 page in total. 1 page withheld in full.
279	3722 - 3726	26/Jan/12	Five-page interagency email discussion concerning drafts of at least five FAA papers on European emissions measure related to aviation. Redacted text in email contains staff questions and recommendations in preparation for future US participation in an international meeting. One page draft paper analyzing targets in European emissions proposal is attached and withheld in full.	(b)(5) Deliberative Process Privilege	5 pages in total. 5 pages withheld in full.
281	3746-3749	26/Apr/12	Two-page email discussion among Treasury staff G. Metcalf and K. Alaimo on proposed response to request for endorsement of IMF climate policy book. One page proposed table of contents and page containing link to the book are attached to the email. Treasury staff recommendation on use of Treasury title for endorsement is redacted, along with email address and phone number.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	4 pages in total. 2 pages released in part. 2 pages released in full.
282	3750-3754	18/Jan/12	One page email between Treasury staff G. Metcalf and E. Urbanas discussing Treasury staff participation in the Brookings AEI carbon tax event, with four-page draft outline attached. Email Text containing staff discussion, opinions, and recommendation on level of Treasury staff participation in the event is redacted under (b)(5). One paragraph containing directions to Treasury was mistakenly withheld under (b)(1) when it should have been treated as Non-Responsive information. This paragraph has been released to CEI. Four page draft outline prepared by IMF is withheld at the IMF's request as containing information classified and protected by the IMF, and thus protected by the USG under exemption (b)(1).	(b)(1) Classified National Security Information; (b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information; NR	5 pages in total. 1 page released in part. 4 pages withheld in full.
293	4020 - 4022	1/Feb/12	One page internal Treasury email from G. Metcalf to Treasury staff E. Urbanas and A. Demopulos discussing Environment office priorities, with two-page list of draft priorities attached. email and list discuss or present proposed suggestions on possible office priorities and reflect pre-decisional staff consultations. The list contains several redlined edits. Mobile phone number is withheld.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages withheld in full.
297	4034 - 4036	16/Jul/12	This email is a duplicate of VI Document 78 (Bate Stamp 1673-1675) and was treated appropriately there. It should not have been withheld in full here.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	3 pages in total. 3 pages released in part
302	4159 - 4160	8/Jun/12	This email is a duplicate of VI Document 201 (Bate Stamp 2762-2764) and was treated appropriately there. It should not have been withheld in full here.	(b)(5)Deliberative Process Privilege, (b)(6) Personal Privacy Information	2 pages in total. Both pages released in part.